

Environmental Impact Assessment Environmental Impact and Waste Management License Application for the proposed Extension of the Ash Disposal Facility and Associated Infrastructure at Camden Power Station

(DEA Ref No 12/12/20/2300 and NEAS Ref No: DEA/EIA/0000399/2011)

Comments and Responses Report

Version 4

This report (Version 4) captures the issues raised by stakeholders during the Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) process and Waste Management License Application for the proposed extension of ash disposal facilities and associated infrastructure at Camden Power Station.

As part of the announcement, a Background Information Document (BID), with a comment and registration sheet was posted and distributed by hand during May 2011. Letters of notification were also sent out by registered mail in May 2011 to all landowners within a 10 km radius of the Camden Power Station. An advertisement was placed in various newspapers and site notices were also put up in the area of the proposed development during May 2011.

An open house and public meeting to discuss the Draft Scoping Report was held at the Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011. This event was announced by advertisements in various newspapers and letters of invitation were also sent out to stakeholders. Issues and comments raised at this meeting as well as comments received during the public review period from 18 July to 22 August 2011 were added as Version 2 of this report to the Final Scoping Report before it was submitted to the Department of Environmental Affairs (DEA).

Two public meetings were held on 17 April 2013 at Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo one at 10:00 and another at 18h00 to present the Draft Environmental Impact Report (DEIR) to the public. The event was advertised in various community and public newspapers. Each stakeholder on the database also received a letter of invitation either via post or email to encourage them to attend any one of the public meetings and also to participate in the public participation process. All comments received during the public review period from 14 March to 24 April 2013 of the DEIR, is included in this version of the report before which accompanies the FEIR's submission to DEA.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1 ENVIRONMENTAL PROCESSES..... 1

2 ALTERNATIVE SITES..... 2

3 BIOPHYSICAL COMMENTS..... 4

 (3.1) Heritage..... 4

 (3.2) Water-related matters 5

 (3.3) Air Pollution 8

4 SOCIO-ECONOMIC COMMENTS 9

 (4.1) Social..... 9

 (4.2) Land Use 11

6 ECONOMIC 11

7 OTHER ISSUES..... 12

8 AUTHORITY COMMENTS RECEIVED 16

COMMENTS, QUESTIONS AND ISSUES		COMMENTATOR(S)	SOURCE(S)	RESPONSE(S)
1 ENVIRONMENTAL PROCESSES				
1	May stakeholders comment at any time during the environmental impact assessment (EIA)? We had previous experiences with EIAs when we were not given the opportunity to comment.	Mr Johan Celliers, Weltevreden, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011	Yes, stakeholders may comment anytime during the whole process and these comments will become part of the various reports used in the EIA process. All comments will be recorded in an Issues and Response Report (IRR) which will be submitted to the DEA. EAP
2	Once a decision has been taken, to whom must we address our appeal?		Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011 and Public meeting during DEIR public review period, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 17 April 2013	The appeal in this case must be address to the Department of Environmental Affairs. EAP
3	It was asked whether there are any other environmental aspects that the attendees believed should have been assessed other than what was presented	Mr Warren Kock Zitholele Consulting	Landowner Focus Group Meeting 4 June 2014 Hendrina	It was confirmed that all associated environmental impacts in terms of the Ash Disposal Facility (ADF) have been identified and assessed. Mr Karel Smit (Smit & Van Wyk Attorneys) & Mr Chris du Toit (Landowner)
4	It was commented that it is an advantage that the Environmental Assessment Practitioner (EAP) is independent as the Department of Environmental Affairs (DEA) will be able to make an informed decision	Mr Karel Smit Smit & Van Wyk Attorneys		The comment was noted. Warren Kok, EAP
5	It was added to the above-mentioned comment	Mr Chris du Toit		

	COMMENTS, QUESTIONS AND ISSUES	COMMENTATOR(S)	SOURCE(S)	RESPONSE(S)
	that it is notable that Zitholele Consulting had done their homework regarding the environmental impacts associated with the ADF	Landowner: Uitkomst		
6	It was commented that there could be a legal risk which is more associated with the negotiations than the EIA. A cadastral map was requested indicating Mr Du Toit's property and how the proposed ADF will fit onto portion 18 of the farm.	Mr Karel Smit Smit & Van Wyk Attorneys		Reference was made to the cadastral map that is included in the Draft Environmental Impact Assessment Report (DEIR) as Figure 7-3 (Landowner map). Warren Kok, EAP
7	The project team was that, as discussed with Mr Du Toit that they fully understand Zitholele's independency, the compilation of the environmental report and that in the end the Department will make a decision. KS said that he and CdT are not experts in this field, and it would be after the Environmental Authorisation has been granted, that they and Eskom will start their discussions and negotiations. The timelines as provided by WK above can be summarised that by the end of October / November 2013 the Environmental Authorisation would be issued by the DEA.			It was confirmed that the assumption regarding the date of the Environmental Authorisation is correct. Warren Kok, EAP
8	The project team was informed that from an environmental point of view, that he and Mr Du Toit does not have any noteworthy comments to submit on the DEIR and the environmental studies. They will await the DEA's decision and believe that at that stage Eskom will approach them regarding negotiations and compensation for Portion 18 of the farm for the ADF.			Zitholele value local knowledge i.e. mining rights, mining activities in the area, etc. Warren Kok, EAP
2 ALTERNATIVE SITES				
1	Alternatives 2 and 3 of the proposed ash disposal facility consist of highly productive soil.	Mr Lood de Jager, Uitkomst, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report,	Acknowledged that site 1 is the preferred stakeholder alternative.

	COMMENTS, QUESTIONS AND ISSUES	COMMENTATOR(S)	SOURCE(S)	RESPONSE(S)
	Soya and maize are planted and these lands produce some of the highest yields per hectare in the district year after year. Alternative 3 lies on a hill. Alternative 1 looks like the best option. This is the most productive part of my farm and I will oppose any development on Alternatives 2 and 3.		Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011	EAP
2	Alternative 3 will pose other problems as well, because a water pipeline towards Kriel runs through it and a 400kV transmission line as well as the Richards Bay railway line.		Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011 and Public meeting during DEIR public review period, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 17 April 2013	Acknowledge, will study during our impact phase. EAP
3	What will happen if you cannot find a site for a new ash disposal facility?	Mr Kenneth Venter, Moreson, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011	Mr Kuzelj said then Camden Power Station will have to shut down once the existing ash facility is full. EAP
4	Common sense should be used in this process to determine which alternative will be used.	Mr Lood de Jager, Uitkomst, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011	Noted. EAP
5	What about old underground mines? I think alternative 4 is on top of an old mine.	Mr Jan van Staden, Uitkomst, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011	Mr Babst said an ash disposal facility may not be built on top of an old mine. This would need to be confirmed. Post-meeting note: An ash disposal facility cannot be established on an old mining area due to stability problems and for this technical aspect the establishment of an ash disposal facility on an old mining area will not be investigated.

	COMMENTS, QUESTIONS AND ISSUES	COMMENTATOR(S)	SOURCE(S)	RESPONSE(S)
6	There are mineral rights on my farm which could influence alternative 3		Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011	Mr Kuzelj said Eskom could look at the possibility to buy out a mining right once a preferred site has been identified and recommended by the EIA process.
7	<p>Alternative 1 looks like the best option for the ash disposal facility.</p> <p>Alternative 2 and 3 are highly productive agricultural land that can provide food for many years to come.</p> <p>There are also old graves on 2 and 3 that have been there for many years.</p> <p>Eskom transmission lines as well a water pipeline are also running through 2 and 3 that will be very costly to move.</p> <p>A major concern is the potential pollution problems of a development of this scale, irrespective of where it is constructed. What will be very important is proper maintenance and management of this ash disposal facility to prevent further pollution of surface water such as what happened between May and August 2011. This cannot happen again.</p>	Mr Johan Celliers, Chairperson, TLU, Ermelo	<p>Final Scoping Report Comment Form</p> <p>and</p> <p>Public meeting during DEIR public review period, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 17 April 2013</p>	Acknowledged. The preferred site will be announced after the impact phase.
8	The proximity of the Richards Bay railway line to site 3, should serve as a basis to fatally flaw the site.	Mrs Tshilidzi Masalesa, Transnet Environmental Department, Mpumalanga.	Public meeting during DEIR public review period, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 17 April 2013	The facilitator acknowledged Mrs Masalesa's comment and concern, and said that the issue will be further investigated. Especially in regards to regulations on to work with Railways, and in particular keystone railways.
3 BIOPHYSICAL COMMENTS				
(3.1) Heritage				
1	There are San rock paintings and figures near	Mr Kenneth Venter,	Open house to discuss	The facilitator said the specialist studies

COMMENTS, QUESTIONS AND ISSUES		COMMENTATOR(S)	SOURCE(S)	RESPONSE(S)
	the area of the alternatives.	Moreson, Ermelo	Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011	have not yet been undertaken and that a heritage assessment will be done and this person will contact Mr Venter to discuss these paintings. Specialist studies done for the EIR phase found no heritage or archaeological sites of importance on or around the proposed sites.
(3.2) Water-related matters				
1	Waste water from the existing ash dam flows into the nearby stream.	Mr Sam Hallatt, Postnet Suite 495, Private Bag X 9013, Ermelo, 2350	Letter on 3 June 2011 in response to the announcement and Public meeting during DEIR public review period, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 17 April 2013	The reverse osmosis plant has been charged, drawing water from De Jagers Pan, and is now running at full capacity at 3.5ML per 24hr day. Due to the extreme high level of the De Jagers Pan, a gradual slow decrease in the De Jagers Pan level over the next few months will be observed.
2	The pan (De Jagers pan) next to the ash disposal facility started flooding last year and all this contaminated water is running east polluting the water resources of Messrs Sam Hallett and Leon Strydom as well as other neighbours. This water is even running through Camden Power Station.	Mr Leon Strydom, Witpunt, and Mr Johan Cilliers, Weltevreden, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011	Acknowledged. Surfaced and ground water will be studied during the Impact phase.
3	When I was young we caught fish in the pan (De Jagers pan) next to the existing ash disposal facility. There was still fish in the pan until a few years ago, but pollution from the ash disposal facility has killed everything in the pan.	Mr Kenneth Venter, Moreson, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011	Acknowledged. The surface and groundwater in the area will be studied during the Impact phase.
4	Will the new ash disposal facility be lined? What will happen to rain water? Will it not leak	Mr Johan Cilliers, Weltevreden, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report,	Yes, the whole proposed facility of 120 ha will be lined to prevent leakages.

	COMMENTS, QUESTIONS AND ISSUES	COMMENTATOR(S)	SOURCE(S)	RESPONSE(S)
	into the surrounding soil?		Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011 and Public meeting during DEIR public review period, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 17 April 2013	There will be a water recovery dam where the excess water and rain water will be stored. This water will be used to transport the ash to the disposal facility.
5	Where do you measure water quality and what about the sewage problem in Camden Village?	Mr Kenneth Venter, Moreson, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011 and Public meeting during DEIR public review period, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 17 April 2013	Mr Kuzelj said water samples are taken all around the power station and especially towards the east, because that is the natural flow of water in this area. This groundwater monitoring information is sent to the Department of Water Affairs, as is required by law. Discussions have been held regarding the sewage problem in Camden Village. Camden Power Station also treats the sewage of the military base next to it. Camden power station has ISO accreditation, which ensures that they must have an Environmental Management System in place. Stakeholders and community members can log a complaint, and the EMS will stipulate specific protocols on how the power station has to work with it. Once the complaint has been logged Eskom then needs to source the appropriate representative internally to respond to and address the complaint.
6	I am also a member of an Ermelo conservation organisation. Will it be possible for us to study	Mr Johan Cilliers, Weltevreden, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report,	Mr Thabiso Mpongo, environmental officer at the Camden Power Station, said he can

	COMMENTS, QUESTIONS AND ISSUES	COMMENTATOR(S)	SOURCE(S)	RESPONSE(S)
	your groundwater data?		Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011	be contacted for this information.
7	The quality of the water in the De Jagers pan has deteriorated due to seepage from the ash disposal facility. What happened?		Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011 and Public meeting during DEIR public review period, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 17 April 2013	Mr Kuzelj said the ash disposal facility receives three times more ash than before due to the low quality of coal being burnt. This has caused the facility to expand very fast, which is the reason why another ash disposal facility is needed. Another problem was that the whole ash transport system was upgraded while the power station was in full operation. More ash is also being deposited, because the scrubbers in the stacks capture ash that would have polluted the atmosphere.
8	Where does Camden Power Station get its clean water from?		Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011	Mr Kuzelj said it comes from Jericho Dam. This water is used for cooling and a small quantity is used for 'ashing' – where water is used to transport the ash to the ash disposal facility.
9	What pollutants can be found in De Jagers pan?		Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011	Mr Kuzelj said tests have shown sulphates, nitrates, sodium, chlorine, some magnesium and a little boron to be present in the pan.
10	Will you take the flood lines into consideration for the new ash facility?	Mr Kenneth Venter, Moreson, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011	Mr Warren Kok said the 1:50 and 1:100 flood lines will be studied during the EIA.

COMMENTS, QUESTIONS AND ISSUES		COMMENTATOR(S)	SOURCE(S)	RESPONSE(S)
(3.3) Air Pollution				
1	Dust suppression must be done. People suffering from asthma live within 5 km of the Camden power station.	Mr Kenneth Venter, Farmer, PO Box 903 Ermelo, 2350	Fax on 19 May 2011 and Public meeting during DEIR public review period, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 17 April 2013	An irrigation system has been considered previously but was not implemented due to the ash dam already being saturated with large amounts of water used for ashing and dusting. However, a dust suppression system on the sides of the ash dam is to be installed in the very near future.
2	The ash of the current ash facility blows onto our thatched roof buildings.	Mr Frik du Plooy, Indawo Game Farm, PO Box 2825, Ermelo, 2350	Telephonic comment on 11 May 2011	
3	The power station has a direct influence on my farm and farming activities due to the dust from the ash facility, which is a problem.	Mr Sam Hallatt, Postnet Suite 495. Private Bag X 9013, Ermelo, 2350	Letter on 3 June 2011 in response to the announcement and Public meeting during DEIR public review period, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 17 April 2013	
4	How many tons of sulphates are emitted by Camden Power Station? Do you monitor the air quality at the station?	Mr Johan Cilliers, Weltevreden, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011	Mr Kuzelj said the stacks (chimneys) of the power station are so high that their emissions cannot be monitored at the station itself. The air quality monitors do, however, pick up emissions from Sasol if the wind blows in the right direction.

	COMMENTS, QUESTIONS AND ISSUES	COMMENTATOR(S)	SOURCE(S)	RESPONSE(S)
5	What about the dust problem?	Mr Kenneth Venter, Moreson, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011 and Public meeting during DEIR public review period, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 17 April 2013	Mr Kuzelj said dust from the existing ash disposal facility is a problem to neighbours. The dust does not come from the top, but the sides of the ash dump. A short-term solution is to put soil on the sides to prevent the dust from blowing away. A 4,5 km sprinkler system has been constructed for dust-suppression. The issue has been escalated to the Camden Environmental Division. Current dust management techniques will be reviewed.
6	The value of a property will decrease if it is suddenly next to an ash disposal facility. Who will compensate a farmer who suddenly has a decrease in the annual yield per hectare due to dust from the ash facility?	Mr Johannes Klopper, Mooiplaats, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011	Mr Kok said this will be investigated during the specialist studies. The impact on crop yield is dependent on the chemical composition of the dust, as well as the frequency of exposure. However, it is fair to conclude that there will be an impact on crop yield and crop quality. Airshed Planning Professionals
4 SOCIO-ECONOMIC COMMENTS				
(4.1) Social				
1	Will there be work for local contractors on this project?	Mr Kenneth Venter, Moreson, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011	Mr Kuzelj said it is Eskom policy to use local contractors if the relevant skills are available.
2	The extension and expansion of the ash facilities are not supported. The Proposed Site	Mr Mandla Ndlovu, Witpunt, Ermelo	Emails dated: 24 April and 25 April 2013	Warren Kok the EAP on the project responded as follows: Many thanks for

	COMMENTS, QUESTIONS AND ISSUES	COMMENTATOR(S)	SOURCE(S)	RESPONSE(S)
	2 and 3 neighbours my property, and is too close to my farm. We are developing accommodation facilities on the farm, and the ash facility will have a negative impact on it. Another comment is that Eskom needs to investigate possible alternative uses for the ash, for example brick manufacturing, charcoal, etc.			your comments, which will be appropriately registered in the Comments Response Report and reported as part of the official record of the project. In response to your enquiry "Why you don't employ other measures to reduce ash waste like to use it to make other products/material,i.e Bricks, Charcoal,etc" I can respond by indicating that Eskom do have initiatives ongoing for the investigation and implementation of projects for reuse of the ash generated at their power stations. Unfortunately the volume of ash is just too high to dispose of all of it in this manner. Currently Eskom manage to re-purpose about 5% of the ash generated at power stations across South Africa. Thus ash disposal / storage facilities will still be required.
3	It was enquired from Mr Smit and Mr Du Toit whether they are aware of any land claims against the property, and confirm that Eskom will confirm the information as well.	Ms Goody Ntuli Eskom	Landowner Focus Group Meeting 4 June 2014 Hendrina	As far as they are aware, there are no formal land claims lodged against the property. Mr Karel Smit, Smit & Van Wyk Attorneys
4	The project team was informed that there are three families living on the farm who they know and accept their right in terms of the Extension of Security of Tenure Act (ESTA). They do not stay on Portion 18 and believe this would not be a concern regarding the EIA preferred site.	Mr Karel Smit Smit & Van Wyk Attorneys		Should these families live within 500m of the proposed ADF, it is important to note as they could be impacted by the dust fall out from ADF. He confirmed that these families will have to be consulted with and that Eskom will undertake the consultation process. Warren Kok, EAP
5	It was further mentioned that the families have been living on the farm for the last 13 years and they are all pensioners.	Mr Chris du Toit Landowner: Uitkomst		
6	It was enquired whether there are any workers working for CdT on the farm.	Ms Goody Ntuli Eskom		It was confirmed that this information will be provided to Eskom after the EIA

COMMENTS, QUESTIONS AND ISSUES		COMMENTATOR(S)	SOURCE(S)	RESPONSE(S)
				consultation meeting. <i>Mr Karel Smit, Smit & Van Wyk Attorneys</i>
(4.2) Land Use				
1	How do you work out compensation for a land owner whose property is needed?	Mr Kenneth Venter, Moreson, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011 and Public meeting during DEIR public review period, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 17 April 2013	Mr Kuzelj said accredited assessors are used to calculate the price of a property. Various factors will be taken into consideration such as improvements done to a property and a final price will be negotiated with the land owner. The facilitator added that Eskom is not interested in expropriating land from anybody and will always try to negotiate a result that is beneficial to all parties.
2	What happens to the land owner who suddenly gets an ash disposal facility next to him? What will happen to his ground water resources? Does he get compensated?	Mr Johannes Klopper, Mooiplaats, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011	Mr Kok said the specialist studies will also look at the effect of the facility on neighbours as well as groundwater. The facilitator added that neighbours do not get compensated by Eskom.
6 ECONOMIC				
1	We request that an additional study be done with specific focus on the long term economic and agronomic impact on landowners as well as the loss in food security. This study should be done by an expert with an agricultural background. Our motivation for this study is as follows: The viewpoint of the EIA that since agricultural land is no longer in its natural state, then it may well be converted into an ash disposal facility is wrong. With this I do not want to reduce the	Mr Johan Cilliers, Environmental Management, TLU, Ermelo	Email on 23 February 2012 and Public meeting during DEIR public review period, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 17 April 2013	The EAP considered the need for such a study and concluded that there was no need for the study because the sites are uniformly the same. The study will not help to differentiate one site from another. The impact on soils and land capability was taken into account as part of the Biophysical specialist assessment. Therefore, the only mitigation measure

COMMENTS, QUESTIONS AND ISSUES		COMMENTATOR(S)	SOURCE(S)	RESPONSE(S)
	<p>importance of natural grazing. The agricultural land in question has a high yield and we have a growing population in South Africa. The land in question has been planted for over 50 years and continues to produce deliver a high yield due to good soil management by the farmers. No compensation paid out to a farmer will make up for the long term loss of production. The current owners are only custodians of the land and it will be needed by future generations to produce food.</p> <p>There is the example of a piece of land in Rothamstead, England that has been producing wheat every single year since 1843.</p>			<p>possible to reduce this impact is to place the site off of deep arable soils, and to reduce the footprint of the site as far as possible. It was determined in the Biophysical specialist study that it is impossible not to impact arable soils at all, as each of the sites have arable soils present. Site 1 was recommended as it has the smallest area, and smallest impact on arable soils.</p>
7 OTHER ISSUES				
1	Who supplies Camden Power Station with coal?	Mr Johannes Klopper, Mooiplaats, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011	Mr Anthony Kuzelj, Camden Station Manager, said coal is currently sourced from eight different suppliers. Some of the coal is supplied from as far as 130 km. Eskom must source coal that is economically viable. Camden was supplied by coal from neighbouring mines before it closed down. Once it was started up again, it was not possible to get a contract with one of the neighbouring mines for a variety of reasons. Eskom's head office procures contracts with coal suppliers.
2	Is all your coal transported by road?	Mr Johan Cilliers, Weltevreden, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011 and	Mr Kuzelj said Camden needs 4, 6 million tons of coal per year of which about 50 % is transported by rail. Eskom has a policy to reduce coal trucks on the road and is looking at alternatives to reduce trucks. One of the options that are being

	COMMENTS, QUESTIONS AND ISSUES	COMMENTATOR(S)	SOURCE(S)	RESPONSE(S)
			Public meeting during DEIR public review period, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 17 April 2013	investigated is a conveyor belt to transport coal to the power station.
3	Why do you transport the coal from so far away? You can buy it next to you from Coal for Africa.	Mr Johannes Klopper, Mooiplaats, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011	Mr Kuzelj said Eskom buys coal with specific specifications and Eskom cannot buy coal that is too expensive. All the Camden coal contracts are short term contracts and long terms contracts are being investigated. Most of the coal mined around Camden is being exported.
4	Does Eskom know about the De Jagers pan overflowing into water resources towards the east? What caused the overflow?	Mr Johannes Klopper, Mooiplaats, Ermelo and Mr Johan Cilliers, Weltevreden, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011 and Public meeting during DEIR public review period, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 17 April 2013	Mr Kuzelj said Eskom is aware of this "overflow" problem towards the east of the De Jagers pan. Eskom built a water treatment plant (using reverse osmosis technology) next to De Jagers pan and the ash disposal facility to purify waste water. This plant has been in operation since the beginning of July 2011 and it will be another two months before the seepage will be under control. The plant cost R38 million to construct and took two years to construct. The main problem was that more water was being pumped from the current ash disposal facility into De Jagers pan and too little water was being pumped out. Eskom has solved this problem by balancing the water being extracted from the pan with the water being pumped back to the pan.
5	Who uses the 1600MW generated by Camden?	Mr Johannes Klopper,	Open house to discuss	Mr Kuzelj said it is not possible to give an

	COMMENTS, QUESTIONS AND ISSUES	COMMENTATOR(S)	SOURCE(S)	RESPONSE(S)
		Mooiplaats, Ermelo	Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011	exact allocation, because Camden power station (like all other stations) feeds the 1600 MW into Eskom's national grid that distributes the electricity all over southern Africa.
6	Can the ash be used for something?	Mr Johannes Klopper, Mooiplaats, Ermelo Mr Mandla Ndlovu, Witpunt, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011 and Emails dated: 24 April and 25 April 2013	Mr Kuzelj said ash is used: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • in cement; • as a filler for rubber; • in bricks • as a filler in toothpaste; and • as a substitute for lime by maize farmers. Camden Power Station will be advertising an open tender process later in the year to start selling some of the ash. The problem is that very low volumes are sold and the buyer must use it close to the power station or else the transportation costs do not make it economically viable. Post meeting note: Eskom has contracted a waste specialist who is investigating other responsible uses of ash.
7	Can this facility be built on an incline?	Mr Johan Cilliers, Weltevreden, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011	Mr Kobus Babst from Eskom said it can be built on an incline with no seepage taking place, because the incline will be taken into consideration during the planning and construction phases.
8	Will this not interfere with the proposed 400kV Camden-Theta line? How far is the EIA on that project?	Mr Johannes Klopper, Mooiplaats, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011	This ash facility will not impact on the Camden-Theta line. The Final Environmental Impact Report of this process is currently with the Department of Environmental Affairs awaiting decision.

	COMMENTS, QUESTIONS AND ISSUES	COMMENTATOR(S)	SOURCE(S)	RESPONSE(S)
9	It is very difficult to download the Eskom Vendor List.	Johan van der Meulen, Adrianople, Ermelo	Open house to discuss Draft Scoping Report, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 27 July 2011	Point noted and will forward to Eskom for their attention.
10	Is there a particular reason why Eskom chooses to use coal of a lower quality? If coal of a better quality where used, there would have been no need for the new ash disposal facility.	Mr Johan Cilliers, Weltevreden, Ermelo, Chairperson, TLU.	Public meeting during DEIR public review period, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 17 April 2013	Comment from Eskom required.
11	The project team was informed that there are some construction activities taking place in the area, but seems to be quite a distance away from Site 1. He said that it is important for the team to note that a mining group is utilising a portion of the farm to park vehicles and a site office has been established. He enquired whether this could impact the footprint of the ADF	Mr Karel Smit Smit & Van Wyk Attorneys	Landowner Focus Group Meeting 4 June 2014 Hendrina	The mining group's activity and infrastructure as mentioned, would not be a concern. Warren Kok, EAP
12	The project team was informed that when he and Mr Du Toit visited the farm they were met by the mining group's legal representatives and commented that it is interesting that the farm Uitkomst has no registered mining rights or being undermined.			The project went through an extensive due diligence process i.e. looking at conditions on Site 1 and from an environmental point of view the team will be going forward with a strong case recommending Site 1 to the DEA. The process forward after the discussions held with Mr Du Toit and Mr Smit is to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The review period for the DEIR ends on Friday 07 June 2013; • Update the Final Environmental Impact Assessment Report (FEIR) with comments received on the DEIR from interested and/or affected parties, including that minuted at the meeting;

COMMENTS, QUESTIONS AND ISSUES		COMMENTATOR(S)	SOURCE(S)	RESPONSE(S)
				<ul style="list-style-type: none"> It is envisaged that the FEIR will be updated and submitted to the DEA by Friday 14 June 2013; The FEIR will be made available for public review for a 20 day review and comment period; After approximately 105 days (from Friday 14 June 2013) the DEA will make a decision regarding the EIA and the Waste Management License Application; <p>The Environmental Authorisation will then be put out for the Appeal Process. Warren Kok, EAP</p>
13	The project team was informed that extensive prospecting had taken place over the past few years but the results had shown that the coal quality is very low and not worth mining.	Mr Chris du Toit Landowner: Uitkomst		<p>In terms of the Geology Report the area identified for the ADF is not ideal for mining. Warren Kok, EAP</p> <p>Although the Geology Report indicate the coal reserve as such, that the Department of Mineral Resources (DMR) might differ. She reiterated that the team needs to obtain confirmation from the DMR regarding mining rights. Goody Ntuli, Eskom</p> <p>It was confirmed that Eskom will obtain the requested information from the DMR. Warren Kok, EAP</p>
8 AUTHORITY COMMENTS RECEIVED				
1	MTPA has no objection to the proposed development or the sensitivity of the site. The preferred site 1 is supported for the new ash	Mr J Eksteen, Acting Senior Manager SS, MTPA	Fax received on 12 April 2013	Comment acknowledged, and responded to on 27 May 2013

	COMMENTS, QUESTIONS AND ISSUES	COMMENTATOR(S)	SOURCE(S)	RESPONSE(S)
	disposal facility and a proper liner with a lifespan longer than 30 years is recommended. Furthermore we thank Zitholele for the professional reporting plans.			
2	Department of Agriculture Forestry and Fisheries raised the comment that Eskom will have to apply for a separate permit for the subdivision of agricultural land. The permit needs to be obtained from DAFF.	DAFF Representative, Ms Mary Mogale	Public meeting during DEIR public review period, Indawo Game Lodge, Ermelo on 17 April 2013	Should an EA be granted, Eskom will apply for all relevant permits.
3	Gert Sibande District Municipality (GSDM) has raised the following matters of concern for them: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The correct starting date and effectiveness of the RO plant on the PS. • Eskom does not inspire confidence that they will be able to manage the new return water dams effectively. De Jager's pan is overflowing, even while the RO plant is working. • Eskom's inability to effectively manage the water level in De Jager's, indicates that Eskom will also not be able to effectively manage and maintain any new dams. The new proposed dam is situated close to a wetland, and if the return water in the new facility overflows, it could lead to severe environmental pollution. • GSDM recommend that Eskom make available accurate information and data regarding the commencement and effectiveness of the RO plant. 	Wisdom Mpofu, Senior Manager: planning and Economic Development, GSDM	Letter dated 24 April 2013, GSDM ref 11/19/3.	The Zitholele project director acknowledged the comments made and issues raised. The letter was forwarded to Eskom for comment. Zitholele, agrees with the recommendation made by GSDM, the data needs to be made available to the public.